Labor Trafficking Cases by Industry in the United States

The presence of labor trafficking in the United States is well-documented1 and the National Human Trafficking Resource Center (NHTRC) has fielded numerous calls from workers in various industries referencing high indicators of labor trafficking. This resource offers examples of labor trafficking cases adjudicated in the United States. This list is not meant to be exhaustive, rather to provide a variety of examples to show the breadth of industries impacted by issues of human trafficking, the way in which such cases are identified by legal practitioners and law enforcement, and the array of criminal charges and civil claims included in labor trafficking cases.

Federal criminal laws on human trafficking are outlined by the Trafficking Victims Protection Act (TVPA) of 2000. The Human Trafficking Prosecution Unit within the Civil Rights Division of the Department of Justice (DOJ) provides a list of human trafficking statutes. Human trafficking victims have also pursued civil lawsuits under the Trafficking Victims Protection Act (TVPA), Title VI and Title VII of the Civil Rights Act of 1964, The Fair Labor Standards Act (FLSA), the Migrant and Seasonal Agricultural Protection Act (MSAP) of 1931, the Occupational Safety and Health Act (OSHA), the Alien Tort Claims Act (ATCA), and various torts, such as False Imprisonment and Intentional Infliction of Emotional Distress.

When deciding which charges to file against a defendant, prosecutors and attorneys must take a number of factors into consideration, such as the strength and availability of corroborating evidence, the severity of the offense, victim’s level of trauma and ability to retell his or story, various statutes of limitations, and the jury’s interpretation of events or behavior. Prosecutors may file multiple charges to increase penalties and demonstrate the full severity of the offense. In other cases, prosecutors may take a “downward stream”2 approach by pursuing lesser charges, based on an estimation of how the evidence and testimony will be processed by the jurors and judges.

Despite criminal and civil remedies available to trafficking victims in the United States, few labor trafficking cases have been resolved through litigation. There are a number of barriers (e.g., cost, fear, lack of knowledge of one’s rights, language and cultural issues, threats of retaliation) that may prevent these victims from seeking legal redress.

The National Human Trafficking Resource Center (NHTRC) also receives reports of workplace abuses and related violations that constitute labor exploitation. Many of the criminal and civil cases included in this resource were initially identified through similar reports to NHTRC that cited sexual harassment, discrimination, wage theft, wrongful termination, contract fraud, or unsafe working conditions. All of the labor trafficking cases in this fact sheet, including both criminal and civil cases, reference elements of force, fraud, or coercion.

---


This publication was made possible in part through Grant Number 90ZV0102 from the Office on Trafficking in Persons, Administration for Children and Families, U.S. Department of Health and Human Services (HHS). Its contents are solely the responsibility of the authors and do not necessarily represent the official views of the Office on Trafficking in Persons, Administration for Children and Families, or HHS.
**Hospitality**

Victims of trafficking may be found working against their will in hotels or motels for long hours for little or no pay. They may work as room attendants, front desk, kitchen, restaurant, server or bell staff, in marketing, in casinos, or in any other service offered by a hotel. The trafficker may be the hotel manager or a labor recruiter/labor broker subcontracting with the hotel to provide a labor supply. If the trafficker is a contractor, the hotel may or may not be aware of the abuse.

- **US v. John Robert Farrell & Angelita Farrell**
  Robert Farrell and his wife, Angelita, owners of a Comfort Inn & Suites in Oacoma, South Dakota, were charged in federal court with involuntary servitude offenses, including: peonage, visa fraud, document servitude, and conspiracy. The Farrells brought four adults from the Philippines on H-2B visas to work at their hotel, confiscated their documents, and forced the victims to sign debt contracts for transportation and visa fees. The victims were required to work 16 to 18 hour days at the hotel and at local fast food restaurants, in order to pay off their debts. The Farrells confiscated their pay, limited their food intake, monitored the victims, regulated their very strict schedules, held late night debt meetings, and refused to let them join community events. Robert Farrell was convicted and sentenced to 50 months in prison and his wife was sentenced to 36 months. They were each ordered to pay a $15,000 fine.
  

  Aborkhodja Askarkhodjaev, owner of Giant Labor Solutions, operated a criminal enterprise that fronted as a labor subcontractor for housekeeping which recruited hundreds of workers from overseas with false promises of employment and valid work visas. Askarkhodjaev and his associates were charged in federal court with offenses that included racketeering, conspiracy, forced labor trafficking, and visa fraud. These victims were coerced to work against their will with threats of violence, deportation, and the withholding of wages. The traffickers deducted exorbitant fees from their paychecks to cover the alleged costs of transportation, housing, uniforms, and food, in addition to deliberately allowing their visas expire. Of the 12 individuals arrested, eight were convicted and imprisoned from five to 12 years. The remaining four defendants fled the country to avoid criminal charges.
  

**Domestic Work**

Domestic workers perform work within their employers’ households and provide services such as cooking, cleaning, child-care, elder care, gardening, and other household work. Domestic workers may or may not live in their employer’s homes. Victims of domestic servitude commonly work 10 to 16 hours a day for little to no pay. Victims of domestic servitude in the U.S. are most often foreign national women with or without documentation living in the home of their employer. Men and boys may also be victims, but these cases are less common.

- **US v. Bidemi Bello**
  Bidemi Bello, a Nigerian woman in Suwanee, Georgia, recruited two women while she was traveling in Nigeria to serve as her housemaid and nanny. She promised these women the opportunity to go to school and receive a salary for their work. Instead, Bello brought them to the United States on fraudulent British passports, kept them in isolation, compelled them to work through verbal and physical abuse, and refused to pay them for their services. These women were forced to sleep on the floor; had their access to food, showers, and modern
appliances restricted; and were required to cut the lawn with a knife and do all cleaning by hand. Bello was charged with trafficking-related crimes including peonage, slavery, involuntary servitude, or forced labor, unlawful conduct with respect to documents in furtherance of trafficking, and harboring aliens. She was found guilty and sentenced to 140 months in prison, followed by three years of supervised parole, and deportation upon completion of her sentence. 

- **US v. Liu (2011)**
  This trafficking case involved two domestic workers with B-1 visas. Hsien-Hsien Liu, a Taiwanese envoy based in Kansas City, Missouri was indicted for fraud in foreign labor recruiting in 2011. After bringing two Filipina nationals to the United States on B-1 visas to work as her housekeepers, Liu only paid them a portion of their contracted salary and forced them to work long hours without holidays or breaks. Additionally, Liu used surveillance cameras to monitor the two trafficking victims who were unable to leave the residence. Federal prosecutors held Liu in custody for 78 days after her arrest and she was not granted diplomatic immunity. She waived her right to grand jury and pled guilty on the lesser charges. That year, she was ordered to pay $80,044 in criminal restitution to these victims and a judge ordered her deportation after she paid over $11,000 in fines. The federal government determined that the two Filipina nationals were labor trafficking victims and they received certification from Health and Human Services, which granted them eligibility to access public benefits and services to the same extent as refugees. 

**Restaurants and Food Service**
Victims of human trafficking have been found in the restaurant and food service industry where they are forced to work as waiters, bussers, kitchen staff, or even cooks or chefs with little or no pay. They may experience erratic working hours or work long hours, with little time off to seek help.

- **US v. Tieu Tran**
  Tieu Tran was charged with forced labor for luring a Vietnamese woman to the United States with false promises of legal immigration status and gainful employment at her nail salon in Mankato, Minnesota. The defendant smuggled the victim across the U.S.-Mexico border, imposed a significant debt on her, and then forced her to work at her son’s Vietnamese restaurant in order to pay it off. Tran admitted to manipulating the victim through debt, isolation, and threats of deportation in order to compel her to work long hours. The case was investigated by the Federal Bureau of Investigation (FBI). Tran was sentenced to one year imprisonment and ordered to pay $51,844 in criminal restitution to the victim. 
Source: U.S. Department of Justice (USDOJ), Civil Rights Division, (http://www.justice.gov/opa/pr/mankato-minnesota-woman-sentenced-forced-labor-case)

**Construction**
 Traffickers within the construction industry may be business owners, recruiters, or crew leaders, employing methods of force, fraud, or coercion to compel new workers into work.

  Following Hurricane Katrina, the shipbuilding company Signal International recruited over 500 guest workers from India to work for construction and rebuilding projects under the H-2B
guestworker program. These workers were recruited for good paying jobs with career potential, falsely promised green cards, and charged exorbitant broker fees of up to $20,000. Once in the U.S., these workers were subjected to unsafe living conditions in trailer camps and charged extremely high fees for rent and food. The Indian workers’ belongings were confiscated, they lived in crowded trailers in a closed compound, and they were not allowed to leave the camp or receive visitors. The situation came to light after a worker attempted suicide following retribution for seeking outside counsel to learn about his rights. The U.S. Equal Opportunity Employment Commission (EEOC) pursued a civil suit against Signal International under the Civil Rights Act of 1964, which prohibits discrimination based on national origin, because only the Indian guestworkers endured the exploitative conditions. In February 2014, a federal jury found Signal International guilty of labor trafficking, fraud, racketeering, and discrimination. The five plaintiffs were awarded $14 million in compensatory and punitive damages. The co-counsel in this suit included the American Civil Liberties Union, Southern Poverty Law Center, Asian American Legal Defense and Education Fund, Louisiana Justice Institute, and Crowell & Moring LLP.

American Civil Liberties Union (ACLU), (https://www.aclu.org/human-rights/david-et-al-v-signal-international-llc-et-al)

- EEOC v. Trans Bay Steel, Inc.
Trans Bay Steel received a sub-contract to retrofit the Bay Bridge in San Francisco, California and recruited 48 Thai workers on H-2B visas for welding jobs, of which only nine workers were placed on the job. The others were held in Los Angeles and Long Beach, CA to work in Thai restaurants owned by the recruiting agencies. The workers were required to pay recruitment fees of $16,000 in order to get the job and start the process of licensure and immigration paperwork, but were grossly underpaid once in the United States, receiving only $200 for three months of labor. The labor recruiters confiscated the workers’ passports, housed them in overcrowded apartments without utilities, and threatened them with crushing debts and deportation if they complained. A customer at one of the restaurants helped the workers connect with the local Thai Community Development Center, who helped the workers escape. The EEOC filed a lawsuit under Title VII of the Civil Rights Act of 1964. A three year consent decree with Trans Bay was agreed upon for an estimated $1 million in monetary relief and compensation.

Source: U.S. Equal Opportunity Employment Commission (EEOC), (http://www.eeoc.gov/eeoc/newsroom/release/12-8-06.cfm)
Civil Rights Litigation Clearinghouse, (http://www.clearinghouse.net/detail.php?id=10383)
News Article, Los Angeles Times, (http://articles.latimes.com/2006/dec/08/local/me-thai)

Agriculture and Animal Husbandry
Victims of labor trafficking have been found among the nation’s migrant and seasonal farmworkers, including men, women, and children who harvest crops, care for domestic animals (such as cattle, horses, sheep, and others), and work in packing plants, orchards, and nurseries. Unscrupulous crewleaders may use violence, threats, and increases to existing debts to hold farmworkers in conditions of servitude.

- EEOC v. Global Horizons
In U.S. Equal Employment Opportunity Commission (EEOC) versus Global Horizons, a labor trafficking case was filed against the Beverly Hills-based labor contractor and eight farms in Hawaii and Washington state that were accused of trafficking over 200 Thai male victims. These victims came to the United States on H-2A work visas and were promised
steady, high-paying agricultural jobs on farms in several states throughout the United States from 2003 through 2007. These victims faced high recruitment fees, had their documents confiscated, faced unequal pay, suffered workplace intimidation, physical abuse, unsanitary working and living conditions, and threats of deportation. The Thai Community Development Center in Los Angeles, CA brought the case to the EEOC who filed the case on behalf of workers in 2011. The case alleged that Global Horizons had violated Title VII of the Civil Rights Act of 1964 and the contractor was found liable for discriminating, harassing, and retaliating against these workers in 2013. One farm listed in the case – Del Monte Fresh Produce – settled the same year for $1.2 million in damages, in addition to pledging to implement training and policy changes.


Health and Beauty Services
Victims of labor trafficking have been found among businesses such as beauty parlors, hair and nail salons, and spas that provide cosmetic treatments that include hairstyling and braiding, massage therapy and bodywork, manicures and pedicures, or skin care.

- **US v. Alex Campbell**
  In 2012, Alex Campbell of Glenview, Illinois was sentenced to life in federal prison for crimes that include forced labor, sex trafficking, harboring illegal aliens for financial gain, confiscating passports, and extortion. The defendant recruited and groomed foreign women from Eastern Europe without legal status in the U.S. to work for him at his massage business, called Day & Night Spa. After gaining their trust, promising to help them with immigration, and offering them financial support, Campbell confiscated their passports and visas, forced them to get tattooed with his moniker, and used violence and threats to force them to continue working without pay or subsistence. One victim was forced to engage in commercial sex with customers at another business location while another victim was extorted into paying $25,000 to escape the situation. The case was jointly investigated by U.S. Immigration and Customs Enforcement (ICE), Cook County Sheriff’s Office, and the Cook County Human Trafficking Task Force which found evidence of both labor and sex trafficking.
  
  
  U.S. Court of Appeals, Seventh District, (http://caselaw.findlaw.com/us-7th-circuit/1681259.html)

- **US v. Akouavi Kpade Afolabi, et al.**
  In August 2007, Akouavi Kpade Afolabi, Lassissi Afolabi, and Dereck Hounakey were charged with smuggling over 20 young girls from the West African nation of Togo and forcing them to work at hair braiding and nail salons throughout Newark and East Orange, New Jersey. The victims were between 10 and 19 years old and had their passports confiscated upon their arrival in the United States. The defendants forced the girls to work without pay for up to 14 hours per day and seven days per week, threatened them with deportation and voodoo curses, and kept them from learning English to maintain their isolation. The victims were placed in protective custody after an anonymous tip resulted in an operation led by ICE. In 2010, the defendants were sentenced from two to 24 years in prison and ordered to pay nearly $4 million in restitution to be shared among the victims.
  

Manufacturing
Labor trafficking in manufacturing has occurred in the garment industry and processing plants in the United States. Victims, both men and women, have been forced to work 10-12 hour days, 6-7 days per week with little or no break time. These victims may be trafficked into garment industry jobs such as sewing, assembling, pressing, or packing apparel. Others may be compelled to work in food processing operations that include slaughtering, preserving, canning and packing goods for distribution. Immigrant workers, both documented and undocumented, are often recruited into these industries. Some documented immigrants include H-2B visa holders who arrive in the U.S. to perform non-agricultural labor or temporary services.

- **US v. John Pickle Company**
  John Pickle of Tulsa, Oklahoma and owner of John Pickle Company (JPC), an oil industry parts manufacturer, was sued by the Equal Employment Opportunity Commission (EEOC) for fraudulently recruiting 52 male foreign workers under the B-1 Temporary Business Visa. JPC contracted with Al-Samit International to handle the overseas recruitment of skilled welders from India who were promised travel, accommodation, medical insurance, overtime, and the opportunity for salary increases. Instead, these workers were subjected to contract fraud, wage abuse, forced to live on their worksite in substandard conditions, falsely imprisoned, subjected to phone tapping, food rationing, restrictions on their religious freedom, and repeated threats. Their passports, visas, and return airfares were confiscated under the guise of ‘safekeeping’ and they were denied further access to these documents. They were forced to perform janitorial work and other menial tasks not previously outlined in their contracts. The EEOC case was joined with related civil actions filed by the workers that alleged false imprisonment, minimum wage violations under the Fair Labor Standards Act (FLSA), deceit, and intentional infliction of emotional distress. In the case ruling, the federal judge ordered the JPC to pay $1.24 million to 52 foreign workers.
  Source: U.S. Equal Opportunity Employment Commission (EEOC), (http://www.eeoc.gov/eeoc/newsroom/release/5-26-06.cfm)

- **US v. Kil Soo Lee**
  From 1999 to 2000, Kil Soo Lee, the owner of the Daewoosa Ltd. garment factory in American Samoa, recruited 250 workers from Vietnam and China to create garments for US clothing brands. The workers were charged recruitment fees of up to $8,000 and subjected to physical abuse, food deprivation, threats of deportation, false arrests, illegal debt repayment schemes, and other forms of retaliation for speaking out against the abuse. The workers were held in secured, fenced in compound. Their conditions were discovered after eight months when the workers sought assistance from nearby businesses in obtaining food donations. Kil Soo Lee was convicted of involuntary servitude, money laundering, and extortion. The defendant was sentenced to 40 years in prison and required to pay restitution in the amount of $1,826,087.
  Source: U.S. Department of Justice (USDOJ), (http://www.justice.gov/archive/opa/pr/2003/February/03_crt_108.htm)

Bars & Clubs
Victims of both sex and labor trafficking may be found in hostess bars and strip clubs in the United States. In both hostess bars and strip clubs, labor trafficking may be present if victims are forced to dance, serve as hostesses, or sell drinks and/or food. Sex trafficking may also occur if victims are
forced to provide commercial sex to the club patrons or if the victims providing commercial sex are under 18. Victims may be U.S. citizens, undocumented immigrants, or foreign nationals with tourist, summer work, or entertainment group visas. Though the victims tend to be adult women, some of these networks also exploit minors.

- **US v. Aleksandr Maksimenko**
  Aleksandr Maksimenko and his co-defendants were ringleaders in a conspiracy to bring women from Eastern Europe to work as exotic dancers in strip clubs in Detroit, Michigan. Posing as a legitimate business, Beauty Search Inc., the defendants promised participants through the J-1 Cultural Exchange Program an opportunity to learn English and work at local restaurants. These young women were forced to dance at strip clubs by threats of physical violence and deportation, document confiscation, debt bondage, and confinement. In particular, one woman was forced to dance for 12 hours a day, six days a week, and forced to meet a daily quota of $1,000 a day, or face physical and sexual abuse. Similarly, the victims were made to believe that they incurred significant debt for travel and entry into the U.S. The defendants pleaded guilty to involuntary servitude, money laundering, and immigration conspiracies. Maksimenko was sentenced to 14.5 years in prison and ordered to pay $1.5 million in restitution and his co-defendants received similar sentences. 
  

**Sales Crew, Peddling, & Begging Rings**

Victims of human trafficking have been found in sales crews or peddling and begging rings, where they work long hours each day soliciting money or selling products such as magazine subscriptions, trinkets, or cleaning products. Traffickers confiscate most or all of the victims’ earnings, making them dependent on the trafficker for transportation and housing. Violence, sexual assault, sexual harassment, pressure tactics, and abandonment in unfamiliar cities are common forms of force, fraud, and coercion experienced by these victims who may include U.S. citizens (in particular, youth ages 18 to 25), immigrants, adults, or children. A "crew" consists of an average of three to 40 youth under the direction of a manager, who moves the crew from city to city every few weeks and enforces daily quotas.

  In May 1998, Adriana Paoletti-Lemus, Renato Paoletti-Lemus, Jose Paoletti-Lemus, and their co-defendants were convicted of obstructing justice, money laundering, alien smuggling, and involuntary servitude. The organization smuggled and trafficked 55 deaf and mute Mexican nationals and nine U.S. citizen children, forcing them to work up to 70 hours per week selling trinkets in the subway of New York City through violence, intimidation, and threats of deportation. The victims were identified by authorities living in two residences in Jackson Heights after four of them sought assistance from local law enforcement. ICE and the Government of Mexico jointly investigated this case and uncovered a similar operation in Chicago, Illinois. As Mexican nationals, the defendants were extradited to the U.S. following incarceration in Mexico for their role in this case. Their sentences ranged from one to 15 years imprisonment, and the defendants were ordered to pay $1.4 million in restitution to be shared among the victims.
  
  
  Attorney General’s Annual Report to Congress on U.S. Government Activities to Combat Trafficking in Persons Fiscal Year 2006
Other Labor Industries

- **US v. Kalu (Healthcare)**
  Kizzy Kalu of Highlands Ranch, Colorado and Philip Langerman of McDonough, Georgia owned and operated Foreign Healthcare Professional Group (FHPG), which recruited foreign nationals to be employed as teaching professionals with high paying salaries at the unaccredited Adam University. The victims paid $6,500 upfront in order to secure their H-1B guestworker visas, and once they arrived in the U.S., were forced to work in nursing homes and long-term care facilities rather than as nurse instructor supervisors. Additionally, they were paid considerably less than what they had been promised in wages and in some instances, Kalu terminated the contract of these victims while forcing them to seek employment elsewhere in order to continue paying a monthly fee to FHPG. When the nurses refused, Kalu threatened them with deportation and said he would notify U.S. Citizenship and Immigration Services (USCIS) of his withdrawal of their visas. The case was jointly investigated by Homeland Security Investigations (HSI), the U.S. Department of State’s Diplomatic Security Service (DSS), the U.S. Department of Labor’s Office of the Inspector General, and the Douglas County Sheriff’s Office. Langerman pled guilty to conspiracy charges and cooperated with the government to receive three years’ probation. Kalu was convicted on 89 counts including mail fraud, visa fraud, human trafficking, and money laundering, and was sentenced to 13 years in federal prison. Both defendants are responsible for $3.8 million in restitution owed to the victims involved in this case.


- **US v. Callahan, et al. (General Labor)**
  Jordie Callahan and Jessica Hunt, of Ashland, Ohio were convicted of conspiracy to violate laws, forced labor, and acquiring a substance by deception. This couple held a woman with cognitive disabilities and her child against their will and forced them to perform manual labor. The couple, along with a third man, would require her to purchase groceries, cigarettes, and other items for them using her public assistance card. The woman was continually subjected to humiliation, psychological manipulation, threats, sexual assault, and physical violence if she did not provide services required by Callahan and Hunt. The couple threatened the victim that they would report her to Family and Social Services to have her child removed if she did not comply. They also intentionally withheld her prescription pain medicine by confiscating it. The victim was repeatedly locked in a room and frightened by dogs and snakes. The victim was identified after she was arrested for stealing a candy bar and declared she wanted to go to jail because “they were mean to [her].” This prompted an investigated by the FBI and Ashland Police Department, and the case was prosecuted by the U.S. Attorney’s office with support from the Ashland County Prosecutor’s Office. Callahan was sentenced to 30 years in prison and Hunt was sentenced to 32 years.


Additional Resources

For more information on labor cases prosecuted in the United States, visit U.S. Department of Justice (www.usdoj.gov), Human Trafficking Law Project (http://www.law.umich.edu/CLINICAL/HUTRAFFICCASES/Pages/searchdatabase.aspx), and The Human Trafficking Pro Bono Legal Center (http://www.htprobono.org/)

Governmental Agencies:
- Equal Employment Opportunity Commission (EEOC) (http://www.eeoc.gov/)
- Federal Bureau of Investigation (FBI) (http://www.fbi.gov/)
- National Labor Relations Board (NLRB) (http://www.nlrb.gov)
- U.S. Department of Justice (USDOJ) (http://www.justice.gov/crt/about/crm/htpu.php)
- U.S. Department of Labor (USDOL), Wage and Hour Division (WHD) (http://www.dol.gov/whd)
- U.S. Department of State (DOS), Bureau of Diplomatic Security (http://www.state.gov/m/cs/)

Non-Governmental Organizations:
- Global Workers Justice Alliance (http://www.globalworkers.org/)
- American Civil Liberties Association (https://www.aclu.org/blog/tag/human-trafficking)
- Catholic Legal Immigration Network, Inc. (https://cliniclegal.org/)
- Centros de los Derechos del Migrante, Inc. (CDM) (http://www.cdmigrante.org/)
- Economic Policy Institute (http://www.epi.org/publication/bp257/)
- Human Trafficking Legal Access Center (http://www.humantraffickinglaw.net/)
- Law Offices of Texas Rio Grande Legal Aid, Inc. (http://www.trla.org/)
- Legal Aid Society (http://www.legal-aid.org/)
- Southern Poverty Law Center (http://www.splcenter.org/what-we-do/immigrant-justice)
- The National Domestic Workers Alliance (http://www.domesticworkers.org)

Case Records and Legal Documents:
- Pacer (https://www.pacer.gov/)
- Lexus Nexus (http://www.lexisnexis.com/)
- University of Michigan Human Trafficking Law Clinic Database (https://www.law.umich.edu/clinical/HuTrafficCases/Pages/searchdatabase.aspx)

Where Can You Find Help?

The NHTRC maintains a database of service providers and resources throughout the United States. Victims and advocates, outreach workers, friends, family and others can call the NHTRC Hotline 24 hours a day to get connected to help.

Report Online or Access Resources & Referrals: www.traffickingresourcecenter.org
Call: 1-888-373-7888 (24/7) Email: nhtrc@polarisproject.org